ACCULTURATION, ENCULTURATION AND INCULTURATION IN THE LITURGICAL MUSIC OF IGBoland: THE COMPOSER’S CHALLENGE.

AGBO, BENEDICT (REV FR)
Department of Music
University of Nigeria, Nsukka.
Email: frbenagbon@yahoo.com

Abstract
There is already an existence of an ugly dislocation between the relatively new Christian faith and the old Traditional religion of Africans. The stage is ripe for ‘cultural identity crisis’ especially in the liturgical music domain. Many churches have abandoned traditional things; others do not know how to combine the old and the new. This paper addresses the polemics of acculturation, enculturation and inculturation with a view towards clarification and systematization. The first encourages the assimilation of a different culture at the detriment of one’s original culture. The second denotes the process by which an individual becomes inserted into his/her culture. The last entails the process by which the church becomes part of the culture of a people already there. Through a theoretical and analytical survey of some of his compositions, this researcher sets some compositional samples with pedagogical guidelines as a kind of pastiche for modern day composers with a liturgical bent.

Keywords: Acculturation, Enculturation, Inculturation, Liturgical Music, Igboland.

Introduction
A critical look at what has happened after over hundred years of Christianity in Igboland reveals a concatenation of the positive and negative forces of inculturation and acculturation joining hands to produce the musical ripples we hear in our churches today. Inculturation as a theological concept connotes the process of adopting the ‘good’ elements found in the culture of a people. According to Nwabeke (1995), ‘inculturation’ means insertion of the church unto a given cultural milieu, ‘Enculturation’ denotes the process by which an individual becomes inserted into his/her culture, while ‘acculturation’ is the opposite action when the individual is made to imbibe new or foreign elements contrary to his/her original culture.

Back here in Africa, and in Nigeria, some of the early missionaries came with a western musical liturgical tradition. They encountered the traditional music of our people. Some were purely for entertainment, some were ritualistic, some were folklores. A historiographic study of the early days of Christianity reveals a lot of successes and failures encountered by the early missionaries because of efforts in inculturation and/or refusal to do otherwise. In the Igboland area of Nigeria, while some missionaries were friendly, some were busy breaking the African drums. In places like Imo State, traditional dance groups like the ‘Abigbo’ were mimicking the missionaries for their failure to appreciate the people’s culture (Onyeji, 2004) while in Ebonyi State, for example, the story was different. The traditional music of the people, for example “Odabarara” and “Okperegede” were very welcome to and by the Churches. Okafor (1994) clearly observes that the Igbo cultural life is full of rites and rituals. Because of this, Ekwueme (2004) argues that the similarities between the Igbo cultural and the Judeo-
Christian culture are the reason why the Igbo are believed to have embraced orthodox Christianity more readily than any other ethnic group in Nigeria. Agbo (2012) has tried to follow the trends of inculturation in Nigerian church music and has observed that while the orthodox churches were slow in inculturation, initially allowing only Hymn translations to vernacular of some liturgical songs, the African indigenous churches (a.k.a aladura churches), made a lot of breakthrough in the area of inculturation and drew a lot of converts especially in the western part of the country. Today, some of the Pentecostal churches, like the Mountain of Fire Ministries are highly against the use of local drums in the church because, according to them, King Nebuchadnezzar’s use of decimal drum was the highest form of idolatry recorded in the bible. Some others like the Redeemed Christian Church of God are more liberal; allowing all forms of local instruments like the Yoruba talking drums into the Church. Some very conservative ones like the Deeper life Bible Church believes that “You don’t bring the world into the Church but you can take the Church into the world” (Apo:2012). They therefore restrict the use of some local instruments considered as “heathen”.

One also notices the growing influence of popular music in Nigerian Church Music today. In many churches, the popular music forms like reggae, highlife, makossa, calypso, hiphop, R&B etc are resounding in their ‘baptized’ forms- old tunes with new texts; old genres and instrumental resources with slight permutations sounding in a new worship mileau. It is interesting to observe those developments but serves also as material for academic research for one to look at the background for the sources and propelling elements behind these developments. For the musicologist theologian, it even calls for deeper challenges and questions of authenticity in Nigerian Sacred Music. Our main task should be to consciously identify the processes of acculturation, enculturation or inculturation going on in these churches taking Igbo land as a case study.

Concept of Inculturation, Enculturation and Acculturation
Inculturation in the Roman Catholic Church.
The term ‘inculturation’ is still foreign to many Christian denominations. It is a theological school of thought most popular among the Roman Catholic and mainline churches that connotes the process of adopting the good elements of any cultural area into the Christian practice or worship of that area. It is a process by which the church becomes inserted in a given culture. (Nwabeke, 1995, Agbo, 2012). According to Flannery (1982) in a document of the second Vatican council “Sacrosanctum Concilium”,

In certain countries especially in mission lands, there are people who have their own musical tradition, and this plays a great part in their religious and social life. For this reason, their music should be held in proper esteem and a suitable place is to be given to it, not only in forming their religious sense, but also in adapting worship to their native genius (S.C. Art. 119).

These Catholic Councilors made it abundantly clear that the Catholic Church rejects nothing that is true and holy in other religions and cultures. According to Tihagale (2010),

Inculturation recognizes that faith has its own life. It is not like a spirit imprisoned in a bottle or in a particular culture though it is always expressed in one or another cultural form. Inculturation argues that faith can find a home
in an African culture and indeed open up its new home to new challenges. Faith, because it has its own life, its own norms, will necessarily transform the host culture so that it becomes of that culture and yet not of that culture (p.1).

The tearing of indigenous drums, for example, in some churches as a symbol of conversion to Christianity, is not a sound mark of faith because the problem is not in the drums or xylophones which a cultural group is using but in their ‘unconverted hearts’. Pope John Paul II (1982) categorically states that “A faith that does not become culture is a faith not fully accepted, not entirely thought out, not faithfully lived”.

Acculturation is the opposite concept which encourages the assimilation of a different culture at the detriment of one’s original culture. According to Ehusani (n.d), there is already an existence of a dislocation between the new faith and the old and calls for an intense process of inculturation that will go beyond the superficial change of vestments and musical instruments to the more profound reflection of the African worldviews. The singing of western worship songs; both hymns and choruses; and the predominant use of western instruments in so-called modern churches in Nigeria cannot be seen entirely as healthy developments.

Enculturation is another concept nearer to inculturation but which does not express the ideal concept. According to Nwabeke (1995) it denotes the process by which an individual becomes inserted into his culture but by inculturation is not intended the insertion of the individual into his culture but the process by which the church becomes part of the culture of a people already there. There is a problem here now. What Umezinwa (2011) calls the problem of “alienation” is the dislocation Ehusani talks about. The typical modern-day Igbo Christian for example, born and bred in Lagos, who knows little or nothing about his culture suffers from cultural identity crisis. One may find it difficult here to choose the correct term appropriate to use for him or her.

Bate (1998) gives a useful insight when he argues that inculturation is a two-way process comprising “on the one hand the ultimate transfer of authentic cultural values through their integration in Christianity” and on the other, “the insertion of Christianity in the various human cultures”. The former case is needed even more in today’s society where the younger generation don’t have a grasp of their own culture and the latter case is also necessary where Christianity (as in the case of many modern Pentecostal Churches today) is busy assuming a foreign culture. This researcher has argued elsewhere (Agbo, 2012) that the Christian religion cannot be monopolized by any particular culture whether Asian, European or African. Although Christ was a Jew, His religion is not essentially Jewish. Christianity is meant to assume as many cultures as it incarnates; Hellenism, Africanism, etc. Bate (1998.) argues that inculturation is a two-way process by which the Universal Church becomes local and the Local Church becomes universal. Each culture provides a dimension of the faith which illuminates the whole and which evangelizes the whole of humanity. He gives example with Monasticism, Marian Devotion, Sacred Heart of Jesus, Corpus Christi processions, Our Lady of Guadeloupe and Pentecostalism. All these are movements that began in a culture and today have a universal meaning. Inculturation, he says, “while it happens locally, is never just a local affair”. Bate (1998) also explains that,
much of the work of inculturation that has been done of late in Africa has focused on rooting and localizing Christianity on African soil and in African cultures. This has often meant revisiting traditional African cultures and religions to see what is compatible with the Gospel and thus available for incorporation into Christianity.

Works on this are found in the Journal of Inculturation Theology (Nigeria) and African Christian Studies. Bate argues that the Catholicism, Methodism or Pentecostalism (or whatever) that we profess today is itself a culture and so inculturation should not be seen merely as integration of faith/Christianity with “culture” as if Christianity itself were not a culture. He argues for the “culturedness” of Christianity itself as a way of life into which people have been enculturated and socialized and in which they often feel much more at home than what some zealous “inculturalists” would like to pretend.

From this wider perspective, this researcher agrees with Bate but argues that inculturation should do more than two things; 1. Fit the Christian principles of worship into the already existing culture of worship in Igbo land, 2. Transfer authentic cultural values to the modern day Christians through their integration into Christianity, 3. Make the African (Igbo) cultural value an object of influence even on the wider church. For example, it is the belief of this researcher that the Nigerian church has a future “missioneering” mandate to teach the western world better ways of worship, and borrowing the words of Okafor and Okafor, Igbo sacred music would become one of our tools of “cultural export” (Okafor & Okafor, 2009 :13).

Umezinwa (2010) commenting on the developmental trends of inculturation in the Roman Catholic Liturgy of Igbo land recognizes three periods; the Latin period, the Imitative and the Innovative period. The first conscious adaptation of the western musical idiom in the Igbo context according to him, was made by Reverend Father Arazu\(^1\) in his translation of the Latin Psalms into Igbo language in his *Abuoma nke Bible*, volumes I, II and III. He made concerted efforts to capture native airs and idioms in the parishes where he worked such as Enugwu Ukwu, Ihiala, etc.

It was the earliest effort to put into practice the Vatican II’s recommendations on inculturation, use of vernacular and local instruments to enhance active participation of the people in the Liturgy. He was followed suit by people like Nicholas Onyediefuna, the composer of *Missa Odudo Nso* and *Ndi biara uka ga-anata ngozi*, Fr. Bede Onuoha, Fr. I.P. Anozie, Fr. Ezenduka, Peace Val Ihim; the composer of *Missa Ncheta* and *Bianu umu Chineke*, Fred Uche, Dorothy Ipere, Jim Madu, Joe Onyekwel and a host of others.

Inculturation in the Roman Catholic Church of Igbo land took a fast lane as composers went beyond mere translation or imitation of English tunes to creative and innovative compositions that could be said to have a truly African character without destroying the catholic sense of solemnity of the Liturgy. The last decade has also witnessed a number of ‘avant-garde’ composers like Jude Nnam, who tries to make use of native airs, the contemporary popular

---

music styles and African compositional elements such as: ostinato, repetition, overlapping, etc. His works; *Missa Ifunanya* (1999), *Missa Unitatis* (2009), *Naranu rie, Som too Chukwu, Ubangigi*, etc, are easily sung by many choirs all over the country because of his deep sense of inculturation.

Other academic musicians from the Roman Catholic Church have also joined in this band wagon of inculturation crusaders. The present researcher has also done a number of works targeted at implementing inculturation ideologies like his *Missa Ofufe di aso* (2001), *Ebube Chukwu* (2002), *Obodo ederego jiji – an Easter cantata* (2009) to mention a few. Jude Nwankwo has *Missa Ekene* (2008), *Nani Idi n’mma* and a number of other works full of inculturation ideas.

**Inculturation in other churches of Igbo land**

The Anglican Church, together with other mainline churches in Igbo land, have also witnessed a lot of development in the area of inculturation. The earliest indigenous composers were W. Echezona who was the first professor of music east of the Niger. Agu (as cited in Idolor, 2002) chronicles the developmental stages in church music in the East in three periods; *the missionary period, period of realization and modern period*. What he calls the realization period is the period after the departure of the missionaries, when indigenous composers, many of whom, studied music in the universities began working on church music using their academic experience of arrangement of folk tunes for large choruses, composition of standard church anthems, solos and duets, antiphons and psalms. There came a realization of what it takes to call a piece ‘African’.

They identified technical problems with the early Christian songs, for example, in their tonal inflexions, rhythmic distortions/syllabic problems, problem of poor development of motifs etc. W. Echezona wrote the *Nunc Dimitis*. Daniel Ojukwu wrote *Madu Nine, Ndi bi n’uwa*. Ikoli Harcourt Whyte wrote so many touching indigenous songs in strophic, homophonic style using parallel 3rds, 4ths and 5ths. Achinivu, (1979) discusses his efforts as a case of musical acculturation in Nigeria. Following these were Rev. Cannon D.M Okongwu who wrote very standard Igbo sacred compositions like *Venite, Jubilato Deo* etc in very complex African rhythmic styles. Often great academic composers like Sam Ojukwu who made extensive use of the xylophones and *oja* – local flute in his works, use of ostinatos, solos, containing chromaticisms, modulations and the sonata form. Some of his works like *Oburuna Jehova ewughi ulo* (Ps. 127) composed for the Dedication of All Saints Cathedral Church Onitsha (1992) stand out for their significant impact on the congregation. Bishop Onyemelukwe is said to have been jolted up from his Episcopal seat at the sound of the oja during the first rendition of that piece. His other works like *Ma Ekele* – 1 Cor. 15:54-57, still reverberate in many churches today because of the deep sense of inculturation expressed in them.

Other academic musicians of the modern period such as Chukwudi Ezeokoli has done significant compositions with a deep sense of inculturation, for example, his work *N’ihina Nwaturu* – Rev. 22:4. His dramatic use of bell (imitating the African cultural style of announcement of death) towards the end of the piece is very arresting. After “ga-azu ha”, the bell sounds three times before the final cadence “dika aturu”. It is a highly contrapuntal piece in eight parts full of sequence, imitation of parts, modulation and has a strong rhythmic bite purely characteristic of Africans.
Reference must also be made to Agu (1999) who marks the era of realization and the modern period with his comprehensive treatment of the main focus of African songs; refrain repetition, response repetition, chorus repetition, mixed structural forms, overlapping etc. Through his many compositions like N’ihina taa n’obodo David (a Christmas carol) he demonstrated the spirit of inculturation in Liturgical music. Other composers like Christian Onyeji have distinguished themselves with the African style for example, his N’ihina a muworo anyi out nwa and many others bear this stamp. Nwamara Alvan and a host of other young composers have followed the band wagon.

The African indigenous churches (aka Aladura churches) have exhibited the strongest sense of inculturation in the church music of Igbo Land. Adeogun (2005) reviewing their effort has this to say:

African music entered the “spiritual” churches full scale and full blown. Beyond the singing of written and newly composed and vernacular hymns, the ‘spiritual’ churches incorporated dancing and drumming for worship. They featured ‘praises’ and ‘choruses’ that are deeply influenced by local popular music like high life, juju and fuji (ch. 5 p. 64)

One cannot fail to observe that these churches; the Cherubim and Seraphim, Celestial Churches, Odoziobodo (generally called ‘ukaegwu’) have exerted very undeniable influences and have revolutionized church music in Igbo land; The clapping of hands, the gospel bands, church match bands etc. have their influence from these churches. Reviewing these, Agbo (2012: 477) says “the Aladura churches can never be forgotten for their policy of Africanizing church music no matter what anybody thinks about their excesses”.

The Pentecostal churches generally did not initially welcome anything called African culture. As Apo Deborah2 a Deeper Life member and a final year student of the Department of Music, UNN put it in an interview conducted by this researcher, “in their (Pentecostals) worship, they seem to move as far away from tradition as possible and this reflects in the lyrics, instrumentation, instruments, performance style, dance patterns and language of their music”. They have generally not done well in the area of inculturation of church music in Igbo land since many of the sects, for example, the Mountain of Fire Ministries, are highly against the use of local drums in the church service. Some others however, like the Redeemed Christian Church of God (RCCG) allow all forms of local musical instruments in the church and have no problem with singing of traditional songs.

Challenge for Sacred Music Composers: Analysis of recent works.
A case study of K’angije’en’ulo Chukwu3 by the present researcher would be apt to illustrate the highpoints of the following principles and procedures for inculturation in liturgical music:


3 https://youtu.be/zzHvjnzC0W4
Choice of compositional texts; The data that are in the form of texts are liturgical texts mainly chosen from the bible and considered suitable for the use of worship in a Roman Catholic setting especially during the Entrance and Offertory sections. The spiritual message is of primary essence here since the socio-functional aspect of the music is as important as its contemplative quality. The texts of the compositions, their references in the bible and their English translations are hereby presented.

Section A

(a) K’anyijeen’ulo Chukwu – Let us go to God’s house (Entrance processional) – Ps 122

Igbo: N’ulo Chukwu, k’anyijee

English: Let us go the house of God

Igbo: Onujuru m obi mbge m nuru ka ha na-ekwu

English: I rejoiced when I heard them say

Igbo: K’anyijeen’ulo Chukwu anyinuru ka ha na-ekwu

English: Let us go to the house of God; we heard them say

Igbo: K’anyijeen’uloChinekejaayamma

English: Let us go to the house of God and thank Him

Igbo: Anyikwuziugbuan’onuzo ama gi O Jerusalem

English: At last our feet are standing at your gates, O Jerusalem

Igbo: A ruru Jerusalem dikaObodoejikorooonunkeoma

English: Jerusalem is built as a city strongly compact

Igbo: O bunaya ka agburunilenaga; agburunke Israel

English: There the tribes go up; the tribes of Israel

Igbo: InyeOnyenweanyiekuledika o sirinyen’iwu

English: A sign for Israel to give thanks as he commanded

Igbo: K’anyijeen’ulo Chukwu anyinuru ka ha na-ekwu

English: Let us go to the house of God; we heard them say

Igbo: Anyiekelegiekeleatukulereoshimirinara nu munyiekpiri

English: We greet you like the antelope who greets the sea to drink from it.

Igbo: Be onyenebu be onyenema be Chukwu bu be Chukwu

English: Acclamations! The music is sweet!

Igbo: One’s house remains his but God’s house is different

Igbo: Turugegeturugege ma turugedefurugede

English: Onomatopoeic phrase showing Divine ownership of everything.

Igbo: Eririmarangwugwu ma ngwugwunaraonyekereya

English: The rope knows the package but the package knows who tied it.

Igbo: Kpeenuekperemaka udo nke Jerusalem

English: Pray for the peace of Jerusalem

Igbo: Ka ndinilehurrugin’anyanweoganiru

English: And prosperity for all your people
In line with the principal aim of this researcher, which is to adapt worship to its native genius (Flannery 1982) and in consonance with Agawu (2003) emphasizing the composers’ commitment to delivering a spiritual message in such a work like this, the following theological and musicological parameters informed the choice of the texts above:

Liturgical solemnity/suitability; every text was selected to suit the particular worship mood and/or situation.

Tone-tune relationship; every text was made to synchronize with the music and vice versa in such a way as to produce what Akpabot (1998) calls logogenic and pathogenic balance. In *K’anyijen’unuruokwunke Chukwu*, the section A heralds the entrance mood of joy into the house of God with the acclamation of “onujuru m obi” and the liturgical exhortation statement “k’anyijee” – Let us go. The climax of this joyful mood was spear-headed by the traditional solo recitatives rendered in proper Ikorodo style. Such statements like “Anyi ekuleguekule atu kulere oshimiri naranu munyi ekpiri” have a way of charging the congregation in a joyful mood that is representative of the truly African man in worship. Such onomatopoeic phrases like “Turugegeturuge ma turugede” cannot but communicate the traditional literary skills. Section B is a more solemn section that calls for prayer for peace of Jerusalem, and prosperity for the people of God. Section C is the apex of the inculturation concept where the dancers are expected to accompany the presentation of the book of the gospel to the altar. The
choice of the text ‘k’anyi gee oziomanuo’ is very arresting and leaves the entire congregation with no option than to listen to the gospel—the peak of the Liturgy of the Word.

As already stated above, the two points of emphasis of the above texts are; solemnity and meaning. Worship is meant to carry both the cultic, evangelical and celebrative sense. It is the texts that put the worshippers in the correct mood of worship. It is the texts that communicate the essence of worship i.e. what we say to God or feel about Him. And it is from the texts that the congregation know when to be sober, when to dance or not, and when to pray in the stricter sense of the word. The texts chosen above were all carefully chosen and woven together to produce the above-mentioned effects.

A theoretical framework for inculturation in the Liturgical music of Igbo land showcases the following concepts as found demonstrated in the repertory of study below;

Use of hocket technique in local horns can be brought into the Roman Catholic Liturgy as demonstrated above in K’anyi Jee n’ulo Chukwu.

(ii) The call and response style can be well developed in the Liturgy as demonstrated in the work below (See bars 37-49).

(iii) The African improvisational style used in Kanyi Jee n’ulo Chukwu are the highpoints of African musical creativity and poetry worth implementing in the art of inculturation (See bars 110-181).

(iv) The Bell pattern and other speech rhythms found in all the compositions above are very emblematic of African music and cannot be ignored in inculturation.

(v) The tonal organization of African melodies is unique. Examples of the use of bitonality have been demonstrated in K’anyi Jee n’ulo Chukwu. Examples of use of pentatonic modes falling on the mediant and submediant notes are also demonstrated here (See bars 201-242)

(vi) The use of the repetition technique, ostinato, improvisation and variation techniques were applied the work. Borrowing Uzoigwe’s phraseology, Ostinato variation style was used in K’anyi Jee n’ulo Chukwu.

(vii) The performance techniques proper to Africa, like the operatic form, hand-clapping, ululations, body movements, use of lively solos, dancing, waist movements, alternate stepping forward and backward and shaking of the body are all taken into consideration in K’anyi Jee n’ulo Chukwu.

Conclusion
The whole idea of inculturation is not about originality but about theological creativity and dynamism in liturgical worship. It is all about how to adapt worship to the native genius. Many churches have not even approved of the idea, but to as many as have, this research provides a lime-light.

Its creative impact lies more in the pedagogical aspect than in the musicological. Inculturation as a theological idea is not new but as a musicological idea is a fresh ground for research since a lot more needs to be done. This is because only musicologists with a theological bent can go far in it and they are few. It requires an inter-disciplinary marriage between music and theology; between ethno-musicology and African theology. With the growth in disciplines
like Liberation theology, African music and Igbo Sociological studies, sacred music in Igbo land has only just become one of the fertile grounds for study.

It is hereby recommended that more ethnological studies and field work be done by musicologists with liturgical music interest. A lot of traditional musical ideas are dying away unexplored and these tantamount to economic waste in the academic domain.

Christian churches should send more musicologists into inculturation research. In such a way, African liturgical music would become tools for future cultural export for world music studies as it is already happening in secular art music. Here concepts like African Pianism are championed by African scholars like Joshua Uzoigwe, Chris Onyeji, AkunEuba etc.

Before long, it is expected that a big revolution would have taken place in the African liturgy and we expect the emergence of new genres and other choral styles better than the popular SATB tradition and a better accompaniment structure than the status quo. Music remains a world of creativity where nature and Divinity intermarry. Music is spiritual and those who perform it do it in spirit and truth. The age-long relationship between sacred and secular music has been one of unity in diversity. Secular music has always been a handmaid for sacred music. Developmental ideas in the two areas usually dovetail into one another. As music history recorded the growth in musical elements like melody, harmony and instrumentation, sacred music had a fair share of its overlapping influence. So also, today, as the church emphasizes the need for inculturation in worship and less of acculturation, musicological studies must be affected by this renaissance.

References


